An Error Analysis of Students’ Translation in Narrative Text

Icha Rauzatul Jannah 1*, Cut Yenni 2, Taufikur Rahmi 3, Alimnur Alimnur 4

1 State Islamic Institute of Lhokseumawe, Aceh, Indonesia.
2 Sekolah Dasar Negeri 1 Jeunieb, Aceh, Indonesia.
3 An-Nahla Islamic Boarding School, Aceh, Indonesia.
4 An-Nahla Islamic Boarding School, Aceh, Indonesia.

ARTICLE INFO

Keywords:
Error Analysis
Translation
Narrative Text

ABSTRACT

This research was conducted based on the fact that most students still made many errors in conveying the meaning from Indonesian to English language. Lack of vocabularies, facing an ambiguity from Indonesian to English, word, phrase, and sentence. Therefore, the purposes of this research are (1) to find out types of errors made by students in translating narrative text and (2) to find out the causes of errors made by the students. The design applied in this research was qualitative in type of case study. Meanwhile, the techniques of data collection were documentation and interview. Nine students were considered purposively as subject categorized into high, middle, and low levels. The technique of analyzing data of this research consisted of data condensation, data display, and conclusion/verification which was found in Miles and Huberman, and Saldana’s model. The result of this research found that (1) there were four types of errors made by the eleventh grade students, namely: omission, additions in simple addition, misformation in regularization and alternating form, and the last one missordering. The highest percentage was misformation. The second was omission. The third was missordering, and the lowest percentage was additions. It is also found that (2) those errors occurred because of carelessness, first language interference, and translation. However, it is expected that the students may learn Indonesian and English seriously in order to increase their awareness in both languages. It is also important that the English teachers provide some creative strategy in learning to avoid any boredom in teaching process.

INTRODUCTION

The act of reproducing the closest natural equivalent of a source language message in a target language is known as translation (As-Safi, 2011). Readers will have difficulty understanding the messages if the translators are unable to accurately translate them (Fadhillah et al., 2019). Nowadays, fluency in English translation is absolutely necessary. This means that students have a better chance of improving their translation abilities. This ability places no restrictions on the trainees. Furthermore, many schools provide programs that teach students the four essential skills of reading, speaking, listening, and writing. According to the 2013 curriculum, students must be able to understand each skill. Furthermore, in order to understand the four skills listed above, students must first translate their object. This means that when students become aware of the meaning of texts they unintentionally read (Dhillon et al., 2020), they must translate the text word for word or phrase for sentence. Unless students want to communicate with people who speak different languages, they must first translate their native language into the target language (Fadhillah et al., 2021).

Moreover, while they know an information that delivered by someone in second language so, unconsciously they have translated the point of the information and understood its meaning. And when they want to compose an essay in second language so, they have to translate from source text to target text. To understand the messages accurately, the translation skill must be taught and mastered. Many teachers use translation techniques to deliver their teaching materials (Pangguna et al, 2021). Translation is most frequently used as a convenient shortcut when teaching vocabulary, by providing equivalents in the learners’ mother
tongues. The other reason is that a lot of written media, such as books, modules, novels, magazines are translated into English language (Tsang, 2020). In order to understand English texts well, a person needs to be able to translate or even master the translation skill. Translation skill is also important for someone who works with TV or movie production (O’Sullivan, 2018).

However, based on the observation which was done by the researcher to the eleventh-grade students of An-Nahla Lhokseumawe, the researcher found some facts related to the translation ability, they are: many students lack of vocabularies either in Indonesian or in English. The students still made many errors in conveying the meaning from Indonesian to English. Many students were distress how to communicate with their friends in English. The students were facing ambiguity of Indonesian word, phrase, and sentence. Based on the facts that researcher got at An-Nahla Lhokseumawe, it was obtained the information that the students have not had ability yet to translate Indonesian text to English well. it means that the ability of students to translate Indonesian text to English may be still poor. Therefore, the researcher conducted research entitled “An Error Analysis of Students’ Translation in Narrative Text.

METHODS

The research approach used is a Qualitative approach that aims to obtain information by conducting case studies to find out the types of errors and the causes of errors made by the students in translating narrative text at An-Nahla Lhokseumawe. The researcher focused on analyzing the errors made by students in translating Indonesian to English in narrative text by using surface strategy taxonomy purposed by Heidi Dulay. This research uses documentation and interview techniques (Sugiyono, 2018; Moloeng, 2017). The researcher involved 9 students of XI IPA 1 that consisted of 20 students to be the research subject. The subjects of the research were from low, middle, and high level of achievement.

Instrument and Data Collection

The Instrument used in this research were documentation and interview. The documentation used to collect even more reliable and factual data for this research in order to find out the types of errors in translation. The researcher asked to the English teacher to give instruction to the students to translate the narrative text. The narrative text taken in: Basic Reading Power, Beatrice Mikulecky and Linda Jeffries by the title “The bear and two friends” on page 11. In the other time, the researcher also conducted an interview with the representative students to get more reliable data. The researcher made 5 interview’s questions to find out the causes of errors. The technique of analyzing data of this research consisted of data condensation, data display, and conclusion/verification which was found in Miles and Huberman, and Saldana’s model.

Data Analysis

The data was analyzed by using Miles and Huberman with the three phases of data analysis. The phases were data condensation, data display, and conclusion drawing or verification. Data condensation refers to the process of selecting, focusing, simplifying, abstracting, and transforming the “raw” data that appear in written-up filed notes. Data display is defined as “display” as an organized assembly of information that permits conclusion drawing and action taking. A display can be an extended piece of text or diagram, chart, table or matrix that provides a new way of arranging and thinking about the more textually embedded data. Then, Conclusion involves stepping back to consider what the analyzed data mean and to assess their applications for the question at hand. Verification integrally linked to the drawing the conclusion, revisiting the data as many times as necessary to cross-check or verifies these emergent conclusions.

To analyze the data of the students’ errors in translating narrative text, the researcher conducted the following steps (1) The researcher collected samples of student’s translation, (2) The researcher identified the errors and prepared reconstructions, (3) The researcher described the errors with linguistic description, (4) The researcher determined types of errors based on surface structure description, (5) The researcher explained the errors one by one based on the students’ translation, (6) The researcher showed the interview analysis from students’ utterance to answer the causes of errors that made by students.
RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Based on data analysis, it was found that types of errors in students’ translation occurred into some categories. There was omission, additions in simple addition, mis-formation in regularization and alternating forms, and the last one is disordering. The highest frequency of error is misinformation in regularization and the lowest frequency of error is addition in simple addition. However, the types of errors in addition of double marking, addition in regularization and in mis-formation form did not found in students’ translation.

Table 1.1 Students’ Error in Omission

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Sources of Data</th>
<th>Translation</th>
<th>Errors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Teman-teman yang baik tidak akan lari</td>
<td>Good friends do not run</td>
<td>Good friends not run</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>...bahaya apa saja bisa terjadi kepada mereka</td>
<td>..anything dangerous can happen to them</td>
<td>..anything can happen to them</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Dan tidak tahu bagaimana cara memanjat pohon</td>
<td>Dan did not know how to climb a tree</td>
<td>Dan did not how to climb a tree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Beruang tidak makan manusia atau hewan-hewan yang mati</td>
<td>The bear did not eat people or animals</td>
<td>The bear not eat people or animals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Dan dan Jim berjalan menyusuri hutan</td>
<td>Dan and Jim walked down in the woods</td>
<td>Dan and Jim walked down woods</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Mereka akan tetap bersatu dalam setiap bahaya yang mengancam</td>
<td>They would be together at any time in danger threatening.</td>
<td>They would together anytime danger threatening</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1.2 Students’ Error in Addition

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Sources of Data</th>
<th>Translation</th>
<th>Errors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Beruang berjalan kearahnya,</td>
<td>The bear walked to him</td>
<td>The bear to walked to him</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Teman-teman yang baik tidak akan lari</td>
<td>Good friends do not run</td>
<td>Good friends do not will run</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Teman-teman yang baik</td>
<td>... good friends.</td>
<td>...a good friends..</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Jim lari</td>
<td>Jim ran</td>
<td>Jim the ran</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Telinganya (Dan)</td>
<td>His ear</td>
<td>...his ear</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1.3 Students’ Error in Mis-formation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Sources of Data</th>
<th>Translation</th>
<th>Errors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Mereka akan tetap bersama</td>
<td>They would stay..</td>
<td>They will stay..</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Dia langsung memanjat pohon</td>
<td>He climbed the tree</td>
<td>He straight climbed the tree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Mereka berjalan menyusuri hutan</td>
<td>They walked down in the woods</td>
<td>They walking to go by wood</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>...di dalam hutan</td>
<td>.. in the forest</td>
<td>..by forest..</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Tiba-tiba,</td>
<td>Suddenly...</td>
<td>To arrive, ..</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Dia memutuskan untuk berbaring di tanah</td>
<td>He decided to lie down on the ground..</td>
<td>He decided for slept in ground..</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The bear walked to him
The bear walked to he
The bear came to them
The bear come to they
The bear told me about ..
The bear telling you about..

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Beruang berjalan ke arahnya</th>
<th>The bear walked to him</th>
<th>The bear walked to he</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Beruang mendekati mereka</td>
<td>The bear came to them</td>
<td>The bear come to they</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Beruang memberitahu tentang...</td>
<td>The bear told me about ..</td>
<td>The bear telling you about..</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Table 1.4 Students’ error in Missordering

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Sources of Data</th>
<th>Translation</th>
<th>Errors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>...manusia atau hewan- hewan yang mati</td>
<td>dead human or animals</td>
<td>human or animals dead</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>...bahaya apa saja</td>
<td>anything dangerous</td>
<td>dangerous anything</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>mereka saling berjanji</td>
<td>they promised each other</td>
<td>they each other promised</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>seekor beruang besar</td>
<td>a big bear</td>
<td>a bear big</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>teman-teman yang baik</td>
<td>good friends</td>
<td>friends good</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The interview analysis was applied in order to clarify and gather any information regarded to the cause of errors that students made in translating the narrative text from Indonesian to English. It was done by transcribing nine interviewed students of eleventh grade IPA 1 at An-Nahla Lhokseumawe. Some informations regarded to the cause of errors were classified into carelessness, first language and translation. As the result, some representative data analyzed were presented as follows:

a. Carelessness

**Data 2.1:**
R: Do you like to translate the text, from Indonesian to English?
S: I do not like translation miss, it is due to the exercise. That is why I do it.
R: Why do not you like it?
S: I dislike it because of complication. I often got wrong, and many things must be considered

**Data 2.2:**
R: Do you like to translate the text from Indonesian to English?
S: Hmm not, miss. I do not like
R: Why do not you like?
S: I do not like it because I do not really like translation.

**Data 2.3:**
R: In working on translation, how do you translate the narrative texts? Mention the steps!
S: I translate the text directly without paying attention to the tenses, miss.
R: Why do not you paying attention to the tenses?
S: Because I do not really understand, miss. I also lacked attention when the teacher gave me instruction. I like to be able to speak English, but I do not like to write or string the language. I only like to hear it. And may be I can speak English later hehe..

b. First Language

**Data 2.4:**
R: Do you usually learn English like translating sentences that you make by yourself?
S: I do it frequently, miss. hmm... when I’m sitting, I try to make sentence then I translate it.
R: How about the example of the sentence?
Data 2.5:
R: When you are translated the text, what are the obstacles that you face?
S: Hmm ... the problems are tenses. For example, I often confused in these sentences; he decides, they promise, they run, they walk, he climbs, he sleeps and others.

Data 2.6:
R: In working on translating, how do you translate narrative texts? Mention the steps!
S: I translate immediately one by one, miss.
R: Would you explain it?
S: Emm... I translate them one by one. For example, buku cantik mean the book beautiful.

Data 2.7:
R: When you are translating the text, what are the obstacles that you face?
S: I usually wrong in use of the pronoun and the choice of vocabulary, miss.
R: Would you give the example?
S: The example is “help they friends”. Hmm, then I often wrong because of a misunderstanding with the meaning of the word. hmm ... “mereka sadar bahwa hal berbahaya apa saja bisa terjadi di setiap saat”. I translated it to be “They are conscious of anything dangerous can happen to them at any time”

Data 2.8:
R: In working on translation, how do you translate the narrative texts? Mention the steps!
S: The way is if I meet a difficult vocabulary, I look for it in the dictionary or ask the teacher. And if the words are easy, I immediately translate it. Then I also noticed the tenses. Although sometimes it is wrong in select the words. it happened because the words do not match.
R: Would you give me the example?
S: yes, miss. The example is people or animal perish.

Data 2.9:
R: In working on translation, how do you translate the narrative texts? Mention the steps!
S: I translated the text as best as I can, miss.
R: would you give me an example?
S: the example is the word tiba-tiba in English is “To arrive”.

Regarding to the first question of the research, the data were analyzed to find out any errors that occurred on students’ translation text. Translation consist in reproducing in the receptor language the closest natural equivalent of the source language, first in the term of meaning and secondly in the term of style (As-Safi, 2011). Indeed, the sense that translation is an activity of changing the language from one into another. Catford said that the translation is the replacement of textual material in one language by equivalent textual material in another language (Munday, 2016). So, to translate is transfer thoughts, idea and information from source language into target language.

Based on all definitions above, Translation is a product of the process in which a written communication or a text in the Indonesian is reproduced in English which interpreting the closest meaning. In
another hand, translation is a process of transferring thoughts and message. If someone doing translation, he/she must find the close meaning for the words or phrase from source language into target language.

**Types of Translation**

There are many types and kinds of translation according from many experts of translation, especially it has similar characteristic. According to Jakobson in Basnett, he divides three types of translation based on semiotic approach to language (Pym, 2017). Further, there are eight kinds of translation with different purpose (Munday, 2016). The types can be concluded that used based on their semiotic approach to language, they are (1) intralingual translation which is related to language variation. (2) Interlingual translation which is related reproducing of target language message with the closest natural equivalent meaning of the source language text and (3) Inter-semiotic Translation which is related to the interpretation between sign systems in which verbal signs are transferred into non-verbal system. While, the kinds of translation are (1) word-for word translation. (2) Literal translation. (3) Faithful translation. (4) Semantic translation. (5) Adaptation. (6) free translation. (7) Idiomatic translation and (8) Communicative translation. from number 1 to number 4 is what called source language-oriented translation while number 5 to number 8 is called target language-oriented translation. Besides, the researcher focuses on interlingual translation type with kind of communicative translation.

**Narrative Text**

Narrative is one of the texts thought in junior and also senior high school level. Narratives text are usually told by a story teller. Another definition, clouse defined the narrative text is a kind of story either fictive or real which contains a series of events in which how the story is told and how the context is presented as aspects of the story construction (Strouse et al., 2018).

From the definition above, it can be concluded, narrative text is a story tells us about something interesting that has purpose to amuse and to entertain for the readers or viewers. We used narrative when we tell something interesting that happen to us at work or school and we tell someone joke. The narrative text taken from Basic Reading Power, Beatrice Mikulecky and Linda Jeffries on page 11:

**Please translate these sentences into good English!**

**Beruang dan Dua Orang Teman**


**The Bear and Two Friends**

_One day, Dan and Jim walked down the forest. They knew that anything dangerous can happened to them at any time in the forest. So, they promised each other that they would be together in any case of danger. Suddenly, they_
saw a big bear came near them. Jim ran and left Dan. He climbed a tree while Dan did not know how to climb. So he decided to lie down on the ground, breathless and pretending to be a dead man. The bear walked over to him and smelt near by his ears and slowly the bear left the man. The bear do not eat dead people or animals. Jim came down from the tree and asked to Dan, “what did the bear say to you?”. “The bear told me about good friends. Good friends do not run away. Good friends help their friends.” Said Dan. Finally, Dan walked down the forest alone.

**Surface Strategy Taxonomy**

According to Dulay, Burt and Krashen: there are four categories for descriptive classification of error. They are linguistics categories, surface strategy taxonomy, comparative taxonomy, and communicative effect taxonomy (Kafipour & Khojasteh, 2012). However, regarded to the focus of research, the theory taken in this research is only concerned on surface strategy taxonomy. A surface strategy taxonomy highlights the ways surface structures are altered: Students may *omit* necessary items (omission) or *add* unnecessary ones (addition), they may *misinformation* items (mis-formation) or *mis-order* them (mis-ordering). This categorization can be exemplified as follows: omission, addition, mis-formation, and mis-ordering.

Omission errors are characterized by the absence of an item that must appear in a well-formed sentence. The table 1.1 showed representative data of omission errors that occurred in students’ translation from Indonesia to English. The omission errors tended to occur in the use of auxiliary verb. Moreover, it is also found in the use of articles, prepositions, and omitted some words. Addition errors are the opposite of omission. They are characterized by the presence of an item which must not appear in a well-formed sentence. There are three types of addition errors, double markings, regularizations, and simple additions. The data in table 1.2, the students added some unnecessary or incorrect elements in sentences. The incorrect elements were prepositions, articles, and the usability of words. From the data showed that researcher only found simple addition errors.

Mis-formation errors are characterized by the use of the wrong form of the morpheme or structure. There are three types of mis-formations have been frequently reported in the literature: regularizations, forms, and alternating forms. The listed data in table 1.3 illustrated the mis-formation errors that occurred in students’ translation from Indonesian to English. In this case, the researcher found that the students dominantly made errors in mis-formation. It is shown that the students tended to select the wrong words in forming correct sentences. However, the researcher did not find the type of error in mis-formation form.

Mis-ordering errors are characterized by the incorrect placement of a morpheme or group of morphemes in a sentence. The data in the table 1.4 represented the mis-ordering. In this type of errors, it happened because of students put some elements words in wrong place or incorrect placement of some words or group of morphemes. The dominant errors are noun phrase.

**Causes of Error**

Errors can occur for many reasons. One of the strategies to prevent students from making the same errors is by looking at the cause of the error itself. There are three majors of errors. There are carelessness, first language interference, and translation (Kumala et al., 2018). There are three types of causes of error will be discussed briefly below.

Carelessness is often closely related to lack of motivation. Lack of motivation may be the result of the presentation style of the teacher (Rahman & Yuzar, 2020), which does not suit the students or maybe the materials are not interesting for the students.

In data 2.1, the student stated that he did not like to translate a text, because there are to many things that must be considered when translating a text. Moreover, one thing that is less attractive to students and creates a lack of motivation. From data 2.2, Students admitted that they do not like the activity of translating text from Indonesian to English. It is because the students do not like translation activities. From data 2.3, Students translated the narrative texts directly without considering the tenses used when translating a text. He revealed that he was less attractive for learning English in terms of stringing and writing. He only likes learning
English to hear it and without regard to the direction or rules of material given by the teacher. This can be classified as the causes of errors in carelessness. Where students are not interested and lack attention to the learning taught by the teacher.

First language interference is the result of language habits established in a native language of the student (Fontiveros-Malana, 2018). When the student uses English, they bring their native language habits into the target language being learned. From data 2.4, The student stated that he often translated his own sentences but he cannot translate the sentence correctly with grammatical. It can be seen from the example; the students write I have two book. In fact, it should be I have two books. In grammatical, two is indicate plural number so the student have to add “s” after the noun. From this example it can be called the causes of errors in first language. Based on data 2.5, The student said that when he translated the text he faced obstacles in the tenses. For example, in these sentences “he decide” to be “he decided”. “They promise” to be “they promised”. “They run” to be “they ran”. “They walk” to be “they walked”. “He climb” to be “he climbed”. “He sleep” to be “he slept”. These examples show that he experienced problems in changing tenses. In this case he is has to use the word in verb 2 (past tense) whereas the students can not change yet the verb correctly. Data 2.6, the student stated that he translate the narrative text with word by word without regard to the word order and still brings her native language habit to the target language. This is classified as the causes of errors in first language.

Translation is the most common source of errors made by students, translating word for word; especially idiomatic expression from the students’ first language can produce errors of this type (Lee, 2020). This usually happens as the result of a situation when the learners are asked to communicate something but do not know the appropriate expression in the L2. From data 2.7, the student experienced obstacles in use of pronoun and word selection. This is evidenced by the example he gave. “Help they friends”, it should be “help their friends”. And the word “conscious” means “knowing” not being conscious of a state under conscious (fainting). This example proves that students experience problems in translating text so that it can be categorized into causes of errors in translation (Silalahi et al., 2018). Based on data 2.8, Students translate the narrative text directly. And if student find difficult vocabulary, he will look for it in the dictionary or ask the teacher who is teaching. Furthermore, student would pay attention to the tenses use that are appropriate for narrative texts. But he stated that it was difficult to understand the choice of vocabulary in accordance with the text being translated. He gives the following example; people or animals perish. Perish means binasa, tewas, hancur dan membusuk, but the fragment sentence is a dead human or animal. Perish it should be dead and student also need to pay attention to the word to be dead people or animals. Dead is adjective and it usually comes immediately before noun.

Data 2.9, it can be seen that the student translating the narrative texts by their understanding. From the example he gave, it was seen that he had an error in understanding about the usability of word, so that the target results did not match with the source of language. The source of language is tiba-tiba; the student’s translation is “to arrive”. The appropriate word is “suddenly”. From the interpretation above, it can be fact that the student still confused about usability of word therefore the target language were not appropriate with the source language. From causes of errors above, it can be concluded that errors occured because the students lack of motivation in understanding English, the students still influenced by their native language, and finally, the students do not know the appropriate expressions in the target language (Sun & Gao, 2020).

CONCLUSIONS

The conclusion can be drawn to answer the problem of the research. The main objective of this study was to find out the types of errors are made by the students in translating narrative text, and to find out the causes of errors are made by the students in translating narrative text. Based on the analysis and the description of data in the previous chapter, it can be concluded that there were four types of errors made by the eleventh-grade students of An-Nahla Lhokseumawe. The types of errors were omission, additions in simple addition, mis-formation in regularization and alternating form, and the last one mis-ordering. The highest percentage was mis-formation. The second was omission. The third was mis-ordering, and the lowest percentage was
additions. The students made those errors because the students lack of vocabularies, confused in grammatical rule, did not know how to change the tenses, not familiar with the foreign language, added or omitted some words, and difficult in the word order.

There were three causes of errors that made by students in translating narrative text. The first, the students were lack of motivation, do not pay attention to the material and do not like English Language. These matters called carelessness. The second, they still interfered by their mother tongue in translating English language. Most students forgot to apply grammar in their translation, therefore, they still translate the text with word by word translation. Finally, most of the students still translate the text directly without attention to the word order, the appropriate word and produce sentences that are not in accordance with the target language.

REFERENCES
